

TEMPLATE 3 – OTM-R Checklist

Case number: **2021IT617948**

Name Organisation under review: Università della Calabria (UNICAL)

Organisation's contact details: Via P. Bucci, 87036 Rende (CS), Italy – hrs4r@unical.it

SUBMISSION DATE:

DATE ENDORSEMENT CHARTER AND CODE: **25/03/2021**

Open, Transparent, and Merit-based Recruitment Check-list: OTM-R

A specific self-assessment checklist is provided for Open, Transparent and Merit-Based Recruitment (OTM-R). Please report on the status of achievement by responding in the "Answer" column: **++Yes completely / +- Yes substantially / -+ Yes partially / -- no**. Also, detail on the indicators and the form of measurement used in the "Suggested Indicators (on the form of measurements)" column.

- The "Open", "Transparent" and "Merit-based" checkboxes are indicative of the type of policies and practices the questions refer to, as detailed in the C&C. They are pre-set in the HRS4R E-tool and cannot be changed. No action is needed from institutions in their respect.
- The difference between "+/- Yes substantially" and "-/+ Yes partially" ratings is that in the first case the volume of the remaining work to be done until completion is little as compared to the effort that has been put so far in that direction, whereas for "-/+ Yes partially", the remaining work is either the same in volume or more than what has been achieved.
- For the "Suggested indicators" column, whenever the user hovers the mouse in the row dedicated to each question, a small text box will pop up, indicating options of potential indicators to use. However, each institution should identify its measurements of the effectiveness of its OTM-R policy which should be further reviewed and adapted.

	Open	Transparent	Merit-Based	Answer: (++)Yes completely / +- Yes substantially / -+ Yes partially / -- no)	Suggested indicators (or form of measurement)
OTM-R system					
1. Have we published a version of our OTM-R policy online (in the national language and in English)?	x	x	x	+ - Yes, substantially	Currently, the internal OTM-R policy and Regulations are available in the national language (Italian) and published on UNICAL's website (https://www.unical.it/organizzazione/chi-siamo/statuto-regolamenti/). The Action Plan foresees: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ the translation in English of OTM-R documents (regulations, fact sheet of calls, rector decrees with the name of the winner, etc.) (A1 and A7 actions); ▪ a dedicated section of the website where all regulations related to OTM-R policy are published (A3 action).
2. Do we have an internal guide setting out clear OTM-R procedures and	x	x	x	++ Yes, completely	UNICAL's internal regulations clearly illustrate OTM-R procedures and practices for all types of academic positions. The regulations related to the various types of personnel, based on current Italian legislation, are

	Open	Transparent	Merit-Based	Answer: (++) Yes completely / +- Yes substantially / -+ Yes partially / -- no)	Suggested indicators (or form of measurement)
practices for all types of positions?					<p>published on the UNICAL's website:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Regulation for Recruiting Full Professors and Associate Professors (D.R. n. 1426, 1/10/2020): https://unical.portaleamministrazionetrasparente.it/moduli/downloadFile.php?file=oggetto_allegati/211013505600_ODr+n.+1426+1.10.2020.pdf; ▪ Regulation for Recruiting of Fixed-term Researchers (RTD/A – RTD/B) (D.R. n. 1765, 22/7/2011 update with D.R. n. 1485, 3/10/2018): https://www2.unical.it/portale/portalmidia/2018-10/selezione%20dei%20ricercatori%20a%20tempo%20determinato1.pdf; ▪ Regulation for Research Fellowships (D.R. n. 1655, 8/9/2014): https://www2.unical.it/portale/portalmidia/2014-09/Regolamento%20%20assegni.pdf; ▪ Regulation for Post-graduate Fellowship (D.R. n. 90, 4/2/2016): https://www2.unical.it/portale/portalmidia/2016-02/reg_post.pdf; ▪ Regulation for PhD Research (D.R. n. 1330, 3/7/2013 update with D.R. n. 1260, 30/6/2014 and D.R. n. 1524, 31/7/2014): https://www2.unical.it/portale/portalmidia/2014-08/Regolamento%20Dottorato%20Unical%20DR%201330-2013%20-%20rettificato.pdf.
3. Is everyone involved in the process sufficiently trained in the area of OTM-R?	x	x	x	++ Yes completely	<p>The staff involved in the OTM-R procedures is adequately trained and skilled in this specific area and regularly attends professional updating courses organized during the year, relevant to its activities and competencies.</p> <p>Currently, the OTM-R training program is consequent to the updating of the national regulations; training on Transparency aspects is periodic (annual).</p>
4. Do we make (sufficient) use of e-recruitment tools?	x	x		++ Yes completely	<p>All recruitment procedures are digitized: job advertisements are published on UNICAL's website and the applications are submitted via PEC (certified e-mail) and/or web recruitment portal:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Web Esse3 Cineca: https://unical.esse3.cineca.it/ (for PhD candidate); ▪ PICA Cineca https://pica.cineca.it/unical/.
5. Do we have a quality control system for OTM-R in place?	x	x	x	++ Yes completely	<p>National regulations are applied, which represent a valuable tool for controlling the quality of OTM-R:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ first of all, a Responsible for the Procedure (RP) is appointed for each procedure, to verify and guarantee that all criteria are satisfied by the eligible candidates, as well as to monitor the fairness of the entire procedure; ▪ moreover, UNICAL ensures that OTM-R recruitment is implemented by making sure that candidates' evaluation is based on a list of criteria (chosen among a list of criteria indicated by the national regulations), detailed in the job description. The selection committee adopts an evaluation grid (before knowing the names of the candidates), which is the same for all candidates and reflects the criteria mentioned in the call.

	Open	Transparent	Merit-Based	Answer: (++)Yes completely / +- Yes substantially / -+ Yes partially / -- no)	Suggested indicators (or form of measurement)
6. Does our current OTM-R policy encourage external candidates to apply?	x	x	x	+- Yes, substantially	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> The academic positions' calls for researchers (R1-R4) are advertised on the UNICAL website, the Ministry of University and Research website, the Italian Official Gazette, and the Euraxess website. All recruitment procedures are public, open and merit-based. Based on the resolution of the <i>Academic Senate</i> (22 June 2021) and of the <i>Board of Department Directors</i> (6 July 2021), an incentive of 0.2 Organic Points (PO) is recognized to the Departments for the mobility of Researchers towards other universities, allowing to increase the teaching potential, especially that of low-performance sectors/areas (SSD), contributing to compliance with the 20% restriction for calls for external professors. <p>To attract a larger number of foreign applicants, the HRS4R Action Plan foresees that future calls will be published along with an English-language fact sheet (PhD positions' calls are currently published in English) (A7 action).</p>
7. Is our current OTM-R policy in line with policies to attract researchers from abroad?	x	x	x	+- Yes, substantially	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> The academic positions' calls for researchers (R1-R4) are published on the UNICAL website and the EURAXESS website. UNICAL makes available a certain number of reserved positions for foreign candidates in the Research Doctorate Calls (for each PhD course is reserved one position for candidates with academic qualifications obtained abroad). The Strategic Plan 2020/2022: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> encourages the implementation of co-supervised PhD (with foreign research institutions) and establishes that each doctoral student spends at least three months in a foreign research institution (international mobility); this will strengthen the scientific collaborations with foreign researchers and will enhance the visibility of UNICAL at an international level; stimulates and supports the participation of researchers from abroad in competitive international calls (eg ERC and MCSA individual fellowships), by implementing direct recruitment procedures for those researchers who indicate UNICAL as the host institution in the case the project is awarded. The Rector periodically activates international calls for the recruitment of foreign professors, based on specific recognition of the departmental needs. <p>In addition, from a technical point of view, to attract a larger number of foreign applicants, the HRS4R Action Plan foresees that future calls will be published along with an English-language fact sheet (PhD positions' calls are currently published in English) (A7 action).</p>
8. Is our current OTM-R policy in line with policies to attract underrepresented groups?	x	x	x	+- Yes, substantially	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> UNICAL Ethical Code (https://www.unical.it/media/medias/2021/2.cod_etico.pdf) rejects any form of discrimination, specifying that all members of the academic community have the right to be treated with equal respect and

	Open	Transparent	Merit-Based	Answer: (++) Yes completely / +- Yes substantially / -+ Yes partially / -- no)	Suggested indicators (or form of measurement)
					<p>consideration without being discriminated against on grounds of their religion, gender, skin colour, sexual orientation, ethnic or social origin, citizenship, etc.</p> <p>Action Plan foresees the Ethical Code translation in English (A1 action).</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> All national and university regulations are consistent to minimize the risk of discrimination of any kind; indeed, recruitment procedures include only selection criteria based on scientific competencies and the number and quality of scientific publications. The university has a gender equality plan in place.
9. Is our current OTM-R policy in line with policies to provide attractive working conditions for researchers?	x	x	x	++ Yes completely	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> UNICAL guarantees researchers attractive working conditions, providing access to research funds, instruments and infrastructures, social security benefits, health insurance and opportunities for training and career advancement, including tools and services to scout funding opportunities. In addition, as shown by the results of the Internal Survey, for the 72% of the survey participants (partially + totally Agree) UNICAL ensures measures facilitating reconciliation of work with both family and private life (e.g. flexible working hours, part-time working, time off from work, sabbatical leaves, Kindergarten and University Sports Centre, etc.) Actions to encourage the participation of UNICAL Researchers in the ERC and MSCA calls are strongly promoted as described in the Strategic Plan 2020-22; currently, UNICAL has 2 new researchers who hold an MSCA Individual Fellowship (Reintegration and Global) and have chosen UNICAL as host institution in 2021/22.
10. Do we have means to monitor whether the most suitable researchers apply?				++ Yes completely	The evaluation commissions use specific checklists that are predefined and directly linked to the recruitment regulations, thereby ensuring compliance with requirements and an assessment of the candidates that is as objective as possible.
Advertising and application phase					
11. Do we have clear guidelines or templates (e.g., EURAXESS) for advertising positions?	x	x		++ Yes completely	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> For each academic position, UNICAL adopts standard guidelines that are available on the Transparency Portal. All recruitment calls and selection procedures are published on the UNICAL website at the following page https://unical.portaleamministrazionetrasparente.it/pagina639_bandi-di-concorso.html. The calls are also published on the website of the Ministry of University and Research and EURAXESS, using the available templates.
12. Do we include in the job advertisement references/links to all the elements foreseen in the relevant section of the toolkit?	x	x		++ Yes completely	Calls explicitly refer to national legislation and university regulations; those references and links are included in the job advertisements.
13. Do we make full use of EURAXESS to ensure our	x	x		++ Yes completely	As required by National Law n. 240/2010, UNICAL publishes research vacancies on the EURAXESS website since 2011 for R1 to R4

	Open	Transparent	Merit-Based	Answer: (++)Yes completely / +- Yes substantially / -+ Yes partially / -- no)	Suggested indicators (or form of measurement)
research vacancies reach a wider audience?					Researchers.
14. Do we make use of other job advertising tools?	x	x		++ Yes completely	All recruitment calls are published on UNICAL and Departments' websites. According to the national regulation, several recruitment calls are also published on the Ministry of University and Research website, the Official Gazette and EURAXESS.
15. Do we keep the administrative burden to a minimum for the candidate?	x			++ Yes completely	UNICAL reduces the administrative burden for candidates by asking only what is strictly needed to comply with the current Italian legislation. The whole application process is done through an online application using the UNICAL web recruitment portal: Web Esse3 Cineca https://unical.esse3.cineca.it/ (for the PhD candidates); PICA Cineca https://pica.cineca.it/unical/) or via PEC (certified e-mail). The candidates upload in an electronic format their CV, qualifications, documents and scientific publications deemed useful for the competition procedure and self-certify the compliance with the eligibility requirements.
Selection and evaluation phase					
16. Do we have clear rules governing the appointment of selection committees?		x	x	++ Yes completely	The rules for the appointment of selection committees are predefined in the UNICAL Regulations, published online and referred to in the selection calls for all types of academic positions (see answer 2). The composition of the selection committees, once appointed according to recruitment calls, is always published online.
17. Do we have clear rules concerning the composition of selection committees?		x	x	++ Yes completely	The rules for the composition of selection committees are predefined in the UNICAL Regulations, published online and referred to in the selection calls for all types of positions (see answer 2). The composition of the selection committee depends on the contractual level of the position advertised; the composition once appointed, is always published online.
18. Are the committees sufficiently gender-balanced?		x	x	+ - Yes, substantially	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Regulations for the Selection of Fixed-term Researchers (Type A and B: RTD/A-B) and Professors (Full and Associate) require that the selection committee has to be appointed, if applicable, according to the principle of gender balance. <p>The Action Plan will extend this principle to all OTM-R university regulations (also for PhD and Research fellows) when the lack of gender balance in some Scientific Sectors/Areas (SSD) does not prevent it (A10 action).</p>
19. Do we have clear guidelines for selection committees, which help to judge 'merit' in a way that leads to the best candidate being selected?			x	++ Yes completely	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Selection committees evaluate the candidates based on the merit criteria (i.e. scientific publications, research experience, etc.) established by the recruitment call for each type of academic position and predefined by National Regulations. Selection committees - nominated according to the regulation and call descriptions (see above) and in possession of relevant knowledge and expertise - employ an evaluation grid (quantitative and qualitative) which is the same for all candidates and reflects the criteria mentioned in the call. <p>The selection criteria are specified by the committee and are aimed at objectively identifying scientific excellence.</p>

	Open	Transparent	Merit-Based	Answer: (++)Yes completely / +- Yes substantially / -+ Yes partially / -- no)	Suggested indicators (or form of measurement)
Appointment phase					
20. Do we inform all applicants at the end of the selection process?	x			+ - Yes, substantially	All candidates are informed via the UNICAL Transparency Portal, where all the documents concerning the selection procedure are published: evaluation grid of the commission, ranking shortlist and publication of the Rector's decree with the name of the winner. In presence of foreign candidates, the Action Plan will ensure the publication of the Rector's decree and the ranking shortlist also in English (A7 action).
21. Do we provide adequate feedback to interviewees?	x			+ - Yes, substantially	All reports related to the selection procedures are published on the institutional website after each procedure. These reports contain a detailed discussion of the criteria, the assessment methods and the results for each candidate. Everyone can request access to the records of the procedure. As described in template 2 (principle 15 – Transparency), the possibility for candidates of being informed, after the selection process, about the strengths and weaknesses of their applications, is limited by art. 23 of the University Privacy Regulation, in line with current national and EU policy (see Legislative Decree n. 101/2018 that aligns Legislative Decree n. 196/2003 to the General Data Protection Regulation).
22. Do we have an appropriate complaints mechanism in place?	x			++ Yes completely	The procedure to initiate an appeal is clearly described in the selection notices and the final approval statement. Two types of appeal procedures are possible: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ appeal to the Rector and the Responsible for the Procedure (RP); ▪ jurisdictional and administrative appeal.
Overall assessment					
23. Do we have a system in place to assess whether OTM-R delivers on its objectives?				+/- Yes substantially	Italian legislation and internal regulations foresee the appointment of the Responsible for the Procedure (RP) for each recruitment call; the RP guarantees and constantly monitors that all the procedures and the entire process are in line with the related regulations and with the call. Moreover, in the Strategic Plan, UNICAL foresees rewards for departments that promote quality recruitment concerning the standards defined by National Scientific Qualification (ASN).